

## Reviews

**G.H.R. Horsley, *Regional Epigraphic Collections of Asia Minor V: The Greek and Latin Inscriptions in the Burdur Archaeological Museum*, British Institute of Archaeology at Ankara Monograph 34, London: British Institute of Archaeology at Ankara, 2007, 321pp + xviii, figs 348 (hardback) ISBN 978 1 898249 18 4, GB £60.00**

Reviewed by Emma Rix

In this catalogue, G. H. R. Horsley has collected together for the first time all inscriptions on stone in Greek or Latin held, as of 1998, in Burdur Archaeological Museum, one of Turkey's largest regional collections of epigraphy.

Three hundred and forty-nine inscriptions, numbered 1–350 (220 is not used) are included in the book, of which 154 were previously unpublished. Some of the inscribed stones recorded in the Museum could not be located during Horsley's survey; these are included where sufficient information is available. Also published are certain stones which have lost their inscription, or never carried one, but which, like the anepigraphic Rider god steles, relate to other inscriptions in the catalogue. The inscriptions are divided into three main sections: dedications and funerary inscriptions, which make up the bulk of the collection, and the 23 public inscriptions concerned with matters such as the administration of cities and the Imperial cult. The majority of the inscriptions date from between the first and third centuries AD.

Horsley's book is very effectively laid out: the Greek text is followed by translations into both English and Turkish, and almost every inscription is illustrated, with photographs inserted into the text, sparing readers from constantly turning to the back of the book to locate them. There are eleven indices in total, including not only standard items such as an index of personal names, index of lexical items, and index of topics discussed, but also indices dealing with religion, abbreviations and features of letter cutting, and grammatical oddities; the latter, although commendably comprehensive, does occasionally (for example under *word order*) omit examples where the feature is discussed in the commentary, and include those where it is not. Two concordances are also given, one of Burdur Archaeological Museum inventory numbers, and one of epigraphic texts in modern publications.

The Museum receives artefacts from the modern administrative district of Burdur, which lies to the NW of Antalya and corresponds roughly to the ancient region of Pisidia, although some inscriptions in the catalogue are thought to emanate from N Lykia and one (73) from Telmessos; in any case, the boundary between Pisidia and Lykia altered at various points during the Hellenistic and Roman

periods. A good map of the region is given on page xvi, and, very helpfully, a grid reference is included in every entry for an inscription with a known provenance.

During the Hellenistic and Roman periods much of Pisidia was very rural, although there were some prosperous urban centres such as Sagalassos. It is therefore unsurprising that many of the inscriptions at Burdur relate to the life of the smaller settlements and villages, with their local gods and cults. Among these are dedications to Anatolian gods such as Men (105–110) and Meter (111–119), and to the Dioskoroi. The cult of the Dioskoroi, although its deities were Greek in name, was primarily indigenous, as shown by its rural open-air sanctuaries and the Anatolian iconography (depicting two riders and a moon goddess) of many of the dedications (27–45); Horsley discusses this matter in the commentary on 26.

The figure of the Rider god was common in Anatolian cult, and around 40% of the dedications in the Burdur collection are steles depicting a type of Rider god specific to Pisidia and Lykia type who brandishes a raised club in his right hand. The vast majority of these steles are dedicated to Heracles or to Kakasbos, a deity known only from Lykia and Pisidia. Kakasbos and Heracles are often considered to be essentially two versions of the same figure, but attempts have been made, for example by Delemen in *Anatolian Rider-Gods* (1999), to identify iconography specific to each and thereby allocate uninscribed Rider god steles to one or the other. Horsley considers this problem in some detail, and concludes that, although the two deities should not be considered interchangeable (as in some earlier discussions), it is likely that many of the anepigraphic steles were not dedicated exclusively to either one of the pair. 83, where the letter cutter appears to have conflated the two names, writing Ἡρακασβος, is of particular relevance to this question, since it suggests an unconscious slip caused by the close connection between the gods. Dedications on Rider god steles also name Apollo (7) and Poseidon (121); it is impossible to tell whether this indicates assimilation or confusion between foreign gods and local gods, or merely that Rider god steles were considered appropriate dedications for a number of different deities. Since Poseidon is shown carrying a trident rather than a club it seems that, in this case at least, the iconography was deliberately made appropriate to the dedicatee.

The Rider god dedications are discussed in detail in the Excursus at the end of the book (pp 255–274), where Horsley makes a number of interesting points. In addition to consideration of the relationship between Heracles and Kakasbos, he argues (§1) that although these steles predominately date from second and third centuries AD they had their origins in earlier Pisidian culture, thinking it unlikely that 'such a distinctive local phenomenon' (p 257) would have arisen at the precise time that a more noticeable Roman presence was being established and suggesting that some of the anepigraphic steles could in fact have been made in the Hellenistic period. However,

it is perhaps also possible that this distinctive local style actually arose in reaction to the increased Roman presence.

Section 7 of the Excursus considers the skill and literacy of those cutting the inscriptions on the Rider god steles (including the letter-cutter of **74**, which is inscribed from right to left) while section 4 deals with the attribution of groups of steles to the same workshop, pointing out similarities between, for example **138** and **140**, and **54-56**, **57**, **60** and **79**. The existence of such workshops makes it very possible that steles were prefabricated, with inscriptions added by the purchaser to stock items. From this another interesting suggestion arises (§6): that those steles which bear only personal names in the nominative (**250**, **262**, **275**, **276**, **277**, **279**) or genitive (**249**, **263**, **289**) were in fact funerary monuments, although perhaps originally created for use as dedications.

Depictions of horsemen begin to be found beside Pisidian and Lykian tombs from before the Hellenistic period, and are usually interpreted as heroised portrayals of the deceased. This iconography is found on some of the funerary inscriptions in the Burdur collection, including **254**. However, the club-wielding rider specifically associated with Heracles and Kakasbos is not usually a feature of funerary inscriptions.

The possibility that these steles were an exception to that rule is supported by **298**, a funerary bomos bearing a relief of a rider with a raised club in his right hand. Even so, as Horsley admits, this interpretation is not entirely certain. It does seem strange that the words *μνήνης χάριν* or *μνήνης ἔνεκεν*, which are found on so many funerary bomoi and steles, were never added to monuments whose nature was presumably ambiguous (although perhaps signalled by their location in a cemetery). A further question, not discussed here, is whether club-wielding riders on funerary steles would have retained some connection with Heracles and Kakasbos, or would simply have been considered to represent the person commemorated.

There is, then, plenty of evidence in the Burdur Museum collection for the continued vigour of local culture in the area, despite the political domination of Pisidia by the Seleukid and, later, Attalid empires from the third century onwards. The continued use of numerous epichoric Pisidian names into the third century AD is further evidence of this.

However, there are also indications among the inscriptions of the influence of Greek culture and language in the area at an early stage. Admittedly there are, at most, eight inscriptions from the Hellenistic period: Horsley suggests that this 'has implications for an assessment of the depth of penetration of Greek in Pisidia, at least as reflected in publicly inscribed monuments' (p 3), although he does not explicitly draw out these implications. The spread of epigraphy is often considered one of the key indicators of the spread of Greek civic culture, and the absence of any non-Greek epigraphy from the area in this period supports

this view. However, it is impossible to be certain whether the Hellenistic inscriptions which do survive indicate groups and individuals with a particular interest in Greek culture, or more widespread Hellenisation.

One of the earliest inscriptions in the collection - perhaps the earliest - is a decree of the city of Olbasa with a response from Attalos II inscribed below (**326**), which shows that the Attalid empire played at least some role in the internal affairs of the city. The city asks for, and is given, permission to honour Sotas, who had received those who were fleeing from the enemy, and was 'well-disposed to the affairs of the king'; this suggests that there had been some kind of strife among the inhabitants. Attalos' answer implies that Sotas was in fact the king's representative in the city; he is described as *ὁ ἐπὶ τῆ πόλεως*, attested as the title of an administrative office in Pergamon (OGIS ii: 483). Whether this should be considered an 'official title' in the context of Olbasa is perhaps debatable, but together with appearance of the *στρατηγοί* and the *γραμματεῖς* and the use of the standard introductory formula 'it seemed good to the council...' it does imply that Olbasa's civic structure was essentially that of a Greek city. Three photographs are given of this inscription, but one (plate 330) has unfortunately been stretched to fit the full width of the page, with the result that it is badly distorted, and does not provide an accurate impression of the lettering.

The earliest 'private' inscriptions in the Museum show an interesting mixture of epichoric names and Greek cultural elements. **204**, the only funerary inscription from the second century BC, commemorates a man with a Pisidian name (Attas) - but a Greek patronym (Menestheus). Unlike the later inscriptions, which tend to be short and very formulaic, this inscription consists of four elegaic couplets, which include both epic language and the word *ἦνις*, found only in the lyric passages of tragedy. The picture which emerges is one of an elite family who wished to indicate their knowledge and appreciation of Greek culture in their father's memorial.

Crucial to the discussion of the extent of Greek cultural influence in the area by the end of the Hellenistic period is **327**, a previously unpublished honorary inscription from Yesilova (19/18 BC). This records how the people of Ze, accompanied by the inhabitants of various neighbouring villages, 'crowned Panagoas with a gilded crown'. The inscription uses the typical formula of Hellenistic honorary decrees, showing how Hellenisation had reached even rural areas by the end of the first century BC. It has now been published fully by Corsten (2005), who suggests a different date.

There are dedications in the collection to many of the gods of the Greek pantheon, including Zeus, Apollo, Artemis (see in particular **21**) and Hermes, although these are not found in such profusion as those to local gods. It is possible that in some cases the popularity of these gods was due to association with earlier epichoric deities; however,

even the Dioskoroi appear in their Greek guise rather than their Anatolian guise in one inscription, the earliest dedication to them in the collection (26, from the first or second century AD).

‘Greek’ culture should not, of course, be viewed as a homogenous set of ideas and images. One bomos (51) dedicated to Hera bears a relief of the goddess holding a phiale in her left hand in addition to the sceptre in her right. This combination is usually limited to Thrace, and its occurrence here draws attention to the Thracians settled in the region by the Seleukids, whose continuing presence is also indicated by Thracian names in, among others, 214 (Ματια), 272 (Δοας), and 273 (Σευθης), and by 328, a dedication to Roma and Augustus set up in 5/4 BC by ‘the Milyadeis... and the Thracians living among them’.

Interestingly, despite the fact that Pisidia was bequeathed to Rome in 133 BC along with the rest of the Attalid empire, and was under direct Roman control, as part of the province of Galatia, from 25 BC onwards, there are only four Latin inscriptions and one Greek-Latin bilingual inscription in the museum. There are no Latin epitaphs or dedications; even the stones from Kremna, which was refounded as a Roman colony in the time of Augustus, are inscribed in Greek, and the *Inscriptions of Central Pisidia* records only three Latin funerary inscriptions known from that city (Horsley & Mitchell 2000). One previously unpublished inscription from near Kremna (222) commemorates Marcus Pacuntius; the lettering suggests a date of the first century AD, making it likely that he was a first or second generation colonist at Kremna, yet he still chose to inscribe his memorial in Greek rather than Latin.

Funerary inscriptions make up around 35% of the inscriptions in Burdur Museum. These are primarily on steles and bomoi, and are often very simple, consisting of the names of the giver and the person commemorated followed by *μνήνης χάριν* or *ἔνεκεν*. The inscriptions show a marked interest in genealogy, naming the fathers and sometimes grandfathers of the deceased; 228 names four generations of males of the family. Many inscriptions commemorate more than one family member, with reliefs often depicting a family group, although it is likely that only some were dead at the time it was constructed. Most steles or bomoi are decorated with a figure, or figures, in relief; as with the Rider god steles, it seems that there were various workshops producing similar funerary monuments in large quantities. Horsley identifies at least two groups: 245, 258, 270, 280, 301, and 308 are a series of steles from the same workshop, and 215, 227, and 311 a series of bomoi.

Four inscriptions, on 226 (a limestone column, previously unpublished) 235, 261, and 252 (sarcophagi) include a warning against disturbing the grave, of the type common throughout Western Asia Minor; considering the profusion of such interdictions in Phrygia, in Pisidia (on sarcophagi at Antiocheia, Termessos and other sites)

and in Lykia it is perhaps significant that none are found on these steles and bomoi, although Horsley does not comment on this explicitly. 261 is also unusual because, although the inscription dates to the second century AD, it is on a reused sarcophagus which dates to the first half of the third century BC and has one of the earliest known examples of the door reliefs which later became common.

316 also reuses an earlier monument, in this case a stele. A previous inscription has been erased, although the remains of 16 gridlines can be seen, and four verses, starting with a hexameter, have been inscribed. This attempt, however, which is the only verse epitaph in the collection other than 204 (mentioned above), was so unsuccessful that the letter-cutter apparently abandoned his work before it was finished. It is possible that the verses commemorate a Christian woman who was persecuted in the area, since they seem to say ‘I went through all of the East and among enemies’ and state that *ὁ θεὸς* honoured her because of her faith. The inscription also talks enigmatically of her coming *εἰς τὰσδε κελαινὰς*, which Horsley understands as an adjective, for which some noun must be supplied, and translates as ‘to these black (roads?)’; however, it also seems possible that *Κελαινὰς* is the place name *Kelainai*, the earlier name for *Apamea* in N Pisidia.

Among the previously unpublished funerary inscriptions included in the catalogue are some inscribed ostothekes (234, 238, 246, 256, 257, 278, 287, 303) and inscribed busts (210, 228, 239, 317, 318). The ostothekes are generally inscribed only with the name of the deceased in the genitive, sometimes accompanied by their patronymic. By contrast, the inscriptions on the busts are longer, and some include the common phrase *ἀνέστησαν* + *name of deceased in acc.* (228, 317; see 210 comm.), referring to the setting up of the figure. This suggests that, when used on a bomos or stele, *ἀνέστησαν* refers either to the image of the deceased in relief (eg 215), or to a bust, now lost, which would originally have been placed on top.

In addition to those public inscriptions already mentioned, there are two others of particular importance. 335 is a bilingual edict (Latin followed by Greek) from the territory of *Sagalassos*, in which *Sextus Sotidius Strabo Libuscidanus*, *propraetorian legate of Galatia*, sets out regulations governing the requisitioning of pack animals and transport from the *Sagalassians* by Roman officials. *Sotidius* states that he is reiterating the orders of *Augustus* and *Tiberius*, in order to prevent the abuses which had been occurring. A scale of payment was set, giving ten bronze asses for a donkey and four for a mule, but with accommodation to be provided free.

A later inscription was sent to *Kolbasa*, in AD 312, by an even more important individual. 338 records a letter from the emperor *Maximinus*, praising the persecution of Christians which had been taking place, and thereby showing the presence of significant numbers of them in third century Pisidia. Copies of the same letter are also

known from Arykanda and (through Eusebios) from Tyre; since these were bilingual it seems likely that the version at Kolbasa was too, although this must remain uncertain.

This well-organised book will be of interest to - and a vital resource for - all those working on the history and epigraphy of Western Anatolia, as well as those interested in epichoric cults and gods more generally, and in the funerary culture of rural areas. The comprehensive indices and convenient layout make it pleasant to use, while added interest is given to a potentially rather dry publication by the longer discussions of general aspects of the inscriptions which are included within the commentaries, usually accompanying the first relevant inscription. These include comments on the Dioskoroi at **26**, on the Perminous sanctuary (the source, or likely source, of a number of the inscriptions) at **16** and on the use of door iconography on ostothekes at **234**.

The non-specialist might desire more background information in some areas, perhaps a brief discussion of the use of funerary bomoi and their possible connection with hero-cults to accompany the useful diagram of a bomos included in the Introduction (p 7), but in view of the large number of inscriptions to be discussed it is not surprising that there is little space for general information; the detailed Excursus on the Rider gods does provide a very interesting analysis of one important section of the collection.

There is an inherent incompleteness in a collection of this type, since the element of chance which governs the survival and discovery of inscriptions from antiquity is exacerbated by the fact that only a part of these will end up in any one museum. Nevertheless, with the exception of building inscriptions, the Burdur collection gives an essentially accurate picture of finds from Pisidia, and Horsley's book draws attention to the many interesting items it contains.

Emma Rix  
Corpus Christi College  
Oxford OX1 4JF

Corsten, T. 2005 Eine hellenistische Ehreninschrift aus dem phrygisch-pisidischen Grenzgebiet, *Gephyra* 2, 115-125.

Delemen, I. 1999 *Anatolian Rider-Gods: A Study on Stone Finds from the Regions of Lycia, Pisidia, Isauria, Lycaonia, Phrygia, Lydia and Caria in the Late Roman Period*, Asia Minor Studien 35, Bonn: R. Habelt.

Horsley, G.H.R. and S. Mitchell (eds) 2000 *The Inscriptions of Central Pisidia: including texts from Kremna, Ariassos, Keraia, Hyia, Panemoteichos, the Sanctuary of Apollo of the Perminoundeis, Sia, Kocaaliler, and the Doseme Bogazi*, IK 57, Bonn: R. Habelt.

OGIS: Dittenberger, W. 1903 *Orientis Graeci Inscriptiones Selectae*, two vols, Leipzig: Apud S. Hirzel.