

Other essays in this collection are: ‘Ancient Mesopotamian Gods: Superstition, Philosophy, Theology’ (28-36), ‘Goddesses in the Pantheon: A Reflection of Women in Society?’ (49-55; 1987), ‘The Mesopotamian Background of the Hurrian Pantheon’ (56-61; 1978), ‘The Pantheon of Mari’ (62-80; 1985), ‘The God Assur’ (81-85; 1983), ‘Der Mythos in Alten Mesopotamian, seen Werden und Vergehen’ (95-107; 1974), ‘The Theology of Death’ (122-33; 1980), ‘The Relationship of Sumerian and Babylonian Myth as Seen in Accounts of Creation’ (134-47; 1992), ‘Myth and Ritual as Conceived by the Babylonians’ (148-54; 1968), ‘The Reign of Nebuchadnezzar I: A Turning Point in the History of Ancient Mesopotamia Religion’ (157-63; 1964), ‘Syncretism and Religious Controversy in Babylonia’ (166-70; 1997), ‘Donations of Food and Drink to the Gods of Ancient Mesopotamia’ (171-79; 1993), ‘The Cult of Ishtar of Babylon’ (180-82; 1975).

The Editors deserve gratitude for making these significant essays easily available and for their care in bringing footnote references up-to-date, among them several that now direct readers to Lambert’s long heralded but posthumously published magisterial *Babylonian Creation Myths* (2013). No serious student of Mesopotamian religion can afford to ignore this collection of Lambert’s essays.

Alan Millard
Emeritus Rankin Professor of Hebrew & Ancient Semitic Languages,
University of Liverpool

Lambert, W.G. 1960 *Babylonian wisdom literature*,
Oxford: Clarendon Press.

Lambert, W.G. 2013 *Babylonian creation myths*,
Winona Lake, Indiana: Eisenbrauns.

James Clackson, *Language and Society in the Greek and Roman Worlds (Key Themes in Ancient History)*, Cambridge University Press, 2015, pp xiv + 204, Hardback, US\$80.00 ISBN 9780521192354; paperback, US\$29.99 ISBN 9780521140669.

Reviewed by A.J. White

Clackson’s book is a clever, simple and accessible study with a primary focus on Greek and Latin, as well as on the Indo-European languages from which they are derived. Drawing upon many different aspects, including the social, cultural, philological, and historical uses of language, Clackson relates them directly to his knowledge of linguistics. One distinctive feature of this book is his practice of stating both sides of an issue: he outlines the salient points or arguments first but does not fail to mention the difficulties arising in the sources or the reliability of the information. This is especially true when speaking of ancient languages, when not all sources – or even the languages themselves – are completely understood. This book is part of a series which aims to

provide readers with a clear overview of various historical topics. Clackson succinctly achieves this goal and this book fits neatly with the others in the series, such as Gillian Clark’s *Christianity and Roman Society* (2005) and Paul Cartledge’s *Ancient Greek Political Thought in Practice* (2009).

Chapter One (1-32) provides a broad introduction and discusses Mediterranean languages in order to map the languages being used in ancient times. Additionally, it indicates Clackson’s scope and aim (his primary focus being Greek and Latin from 800BC to AD400). He looks at several issues including dialectal differences (though very broadly) as well as language change. He demonstrates the variety and complexity of languages and language families that are in use in the ancient Mediterranean, which aids in the understanding of language change. Clackson discusses bilingualism and how bilingual societies can have an impact upon a language. Chapter Two (33-62) then explores this further in his discussion of languages (including Old Persian as well as Greek and Latin) in their political and administrative uses and how languages can develop from a need to express different concepts or vocabulary in a political or administrative context. Within this chapter he analyses the ‘standardization,’ that is, the ‘standardizing,’ *written* form of languages including Latin and Greek; and next he gives consideration to the different dialects of Greek. This section could easily have been expanded and more information on Atticism in the early imperial period would have been helpful; however, it would have been difficult to include all the necessary information in a book designed to be part of a series in which succinctness is a primary feature. Accordingly, Clackson has done well in summarizing the main points.

Chapter Three (63-95) addresses again the concept of bilingualism in the ancient world as well as how a language can contribute to the formation of a person’s identity. The author looks into several aspects of language and how language may sometimes (but not always) relate to one’s ethnic or national identity. The author draws upon documentary sources in this chapter and advances some stimulating points arising from bilingual inscriptions. These languages include, but are not limited to, Greek and Latin but also Greek with Gaulish, Punic and Eteocypriot. Some of these texts contain the same information, which can also offer a comparison between the uses of each language. This is of interest for the study of bilingualism in the ancient world, especially when considering the idea of transliteration, where the writer uses e.g. Latin words but writes them with Greek lettering. One additional example is a Jewish epitaph in Rome where KOYAI BIEIT is written for Latin *quae vixit* (CIJ 1.257; D. Noy, *Jewish Inscriptions of Western Europe, Vol. 2, The City of Rome*, Cambridge, 1995, no. 275). One should also mention the bilingual phenomenon of ‘code-switching,’ where the writer switches from one language to another in the same text (e.g. CIJ 1.523; Noy no. 577).

Chapter Four (96-122) discusses language variation, offering the example of the pronunciation of *r* in different English-speaking countries and then explores language variation in Greek and Latin. He looks at how these changes are reflected in literary texts, in particular, how Aristophanes uses his characters to reflect language change and variation (including dialectal differences). Clackson recognises the difficulty of applying modern linguistic approaches to an ancient language, where there are only written texts surviving for study and no oral informants. This is an especially stimulating chapter, and the author has included useful detail on a complex topic.

Chapter Five (123-142) explores gender differences in speech, including the use of obscenities and euphemisms. Again, Clackson acknowledges the difficulties arising from this when studying Greek and Latin texts, since there are so many fewer texts written by women than by men. Papyrus letters give us occasional shafts of light on to this topic, for further examples see *P.Oxy 12* (1916) 1467 (petition, 263CE) and 46 (1978) 3313 (letter dictated and then corrected by a woman, AD II). On female speech in Greek and Latin comedy the articles by J.N. Adams and D. Bain, respectively, which are included in Clackson's references, are particularly useful.

Chapter Six (143-170) focuses on language used in religious contexts (Christianity primarily) and deals with the translation history of biblical texts, looking at languages individually including Greek, Latin and Hebrew as well as Aramaic, Syriac and Coptic. There are two particular points worth noting, the first is that Clackson mentions that, in the first-written gospel, Mark represents Jesus speaking in Greek and occasionally switching to Aramaic (153-154). Perhaps, however, Mark's variation is not indicative of Jesus' actual language choices, but rather that Mark was writing for a Greek-speaking audience and only used Aramaic at pivotal moments. Mark, as well as Matthew, uses Aramaic (in Greek lettering) for Jesus' final utterance on the cross but both writers also provide a translation. In Mark 7.34 the Aramaic word *ephphatha* is translated for his Greek readers (see Graham Stanton, *The Gospels and Jesus*, 2nd edn, Oxford, 2002, 39). So while Mark does use Aramaic in several places, he is writing for a Greek audience and thereby his use of the Greek language for Jesus' speech is not indicative of what Mark thought him to be actually speaking. Secondly, Clackson uses 1 Corinthians 14:19 as an example of Paul's insistence of keeping language simple and intelligible (158 *n.*15). This verse, however, is not discussing the writing of texts, nor the normal spoken language, but Paul here is speaking of the intra-group, 'spiritual' phenomenon of *glossolalia*. Here Paul is arguing that it is better to be understood (i.e to speak in the same language) than to speak in a communal context in a way that others cannot humanly understand. On the whole, this chapter does raise some thoughtful issues, and deals with a large variety of topics that are important when looking at the language of religious texts.

The Conclusion (171-175) neatly draws together the entire book while reminding the reader of the limitations of studying 'dead' languages. The author reassures his audience that, despite the difficulties faced with only having written evidence, modern linguistics can still play a crucial role in research on ancient languages. A brief bibliographic essay (176-178) concludes the book, offering numerous sources for both the ancient languages as well as linguistics. This is followed by a current and extensive reference list. One additional resource would be G. Giannakis (ed.), *Encyclopedia of Ancient Greek Language and Linguistics*, 3 vols, Leiden, Brill, 2014; however, this only came out just before Clackson's book.

This excellent book by a writer expert on his subject is a useful introduction for any individual who has a developing interest in linguistics and the ancient world. Clackson provides some attractive linguistic maps of the languages spoken around the Mediterranean, including one which illustrates the variety of Greek dialects at different periods. It would perhaps have been helpful if there were more footnotes provided in order to follow up some of Clackson's statements; but by the same token, excessive apparatus may detract from the readability that makes this book so appealing to beginners.

A.J. White
University of New England
Armidale, NSW, 2351
awhite55@une.edu.au

Vered Shalev-Hurvitz, *Holy Sites Encircled: The Early Byzantine Concentric Churches of Jerusalem*, Oxford Studies in Byzantium, Oxford University Press, New York, 2015, pp 430, includes plans and diagrams (42 figures) and 2 maps + 19 plates, ISBN 978-0-19-965377-5, £90

Reviewed by Susan Balderstone

Vered Shalev-Hurvitz has brought together documentary sources and archaeological research on four significant early churches in Jerusalem. Based largely on her doctoral thesis, the book focuses on one still existing monument - the Anastasis dome of the Church of the Holy Sepulchre and three others known from historical sources and archaeological remains. These three are the Church of the Ascension (also known as the Imbomon), the Kathisma Church (built over the rock on which Mary rested on her way to Bethlehem) and the now lost upper church over Mary's Tomb.

Argument is presented to support the proposition that the first two were foundations of Constantine dedicated to Jesus following the Council of Nicaea in AD 325, that the second two were built under the auspices of Bishop Juvenal and dedicated to Mary Mother of God following the Council of Ephesus in AD 431, and that they were all built as statements about the importance of Jerusalem as a Holy City. The landmark status of the churches was em-